‘Fun’ in ‘Functional’
Factors in the Acceptance of EDRMS (T31)

Lisa Daulby CRM, IGP & Weimei Pan
ARMA Canada Conference and Expo
May 26th 2015
Speaker Introductions

Lisa Daulby
CRM, IGP

Weimei Pan
Session Agenda/Outline

- Overview InterPARES Trust
- Fun in Functional Research Project
- Research Design
- Preliminary Analysis & Finding
- Questions and Answers
InterPARES Trust

• Multi-national, interdisciplinary research project exploring issues concerning digital records and data entrusted to the Internet.

• Goal is to generate theoretical and methodological frameworks to develop local, national and international policies, procedures, regulations, standards and legislation, in order to ensure public trust grounded on evidence of good governance, a strong digital economy, and a persistent digital memory.

• The International Alliance comprises 7 Teams.

• Research Domains – Infrastructure, Security, Access, Control, Legal, Terminology, Resources, Policy, Social/Societal Issues and Education.
Putting the “Fun” in Functional

- This research looks at trust relationships from the perspective of the creators and internal users of organizational information/records and relevant systems/technologies.
- Understanding how people engage with the information they create/use to accomplish their work in networked environments.
- Goal is to improve relationships by positively influencing the way in which individuals perceive their work practices and the tools they use to accomplish them.
- Explores some of the socio-technical factors that appear to affect the management of written and non-written information in organizations.
- Provide insights into the shared perceptions and understandings that has an impact on, and is influenced by, the way we trust information objects, people, and technology.
Research Team

Fiorella Foscarini, PhD, Assistant Professor Faculty of Information University of Toronto

Gillian Oliver, PhD, Programme Director School of Information Management Victoria University of Wellington

Lisa Daulby, PhD Candidate, Lecturer, San Jose State University School of Information / Records Manager RBC

Weimei Pan, PhD Candidate, School of Library, Archival and Information Studies, University of British Columbia (UBC)

Jim Suderman, Director Information Access, Corporate Information Management Services City Clerk's Office Toronto
Research Questions

How do users interact with EDRMS in the different stages of adoption (initial introduction, adjustment to the system, continued use, etc.)?

How do users perceive the different functions of EDRMS in relation to their own personal information management?

What are users’ opinions on introducing gamification elements into EDRMS?
Literature Review

- Game Studies & Gamification
- Personal Information Management
- Human-Technology Interaction
Research Design

• Qualitative research design.
• Fun Theory – Volkswagen.
• Semi-structured interviews were conducted with 17 public sector employees from the City of Toronto (11) and City of Vancouver (6).
• Sample participants were recruited through formal contacts (e.g., emails) with individuals working for the institutions identified as candidates. Different functional roles and from different units or divisions.
• Descriptions of the systems.
• Data was collected onsite by two independent researchers in each research location during normal business hours.
• Researchers used similar interview protocol – interview guide.
• The data was be analyzed for overarching patterns and themes using Nvivo qualitative analysis software.
• Ethical Considerations – Data collected was anonymized and securely stored. All institutional ethical review board criteria was attained.
Interview Guide

Instrumentation based on Records Management and Information Culture: Tackling the People Problem

- Value Accorded to Records/Information Management
- Introduction and Continued Use of Information System
- System Functionality
- BYOD
- Game Elements & Motivation
- Trust in Information Systems
- Information Storage and Cloud Services
Preliminary Findings

Initial Reaction

Adjustment

Strategy

Bring Your Own Device (BYOD)

The Cloud

Gamification
The System is ...

- “But now, we don’t know what we would do without it. It just makes everybody’s life so much easier.” –Interviewee1
- “It’s actually a very good tool.” –Interviewee1
- “… it’s unbelievable, the power if it.” –Interviewee2
- “Also this particular system seems very, very user-friendly. … and it seems like it’s easy to use.” –Interviewee4
- “…to me the system is intuitive,…” –Interviewee6
- “…it’s got way more functionality…” -- Interviewee1
- “…is much more versatile…” --Interviewee4
- “…there is so much capability within …, that we can use it several different ways…” --Interviewee6
- “…it’s extremely comprehensive…” --Interviewee6
Initial Reaction

- “[N]eutral to negative, I would say” --Interviewee6
- “…as soon as they told me about it. It’s kinda tough because like we actually had an old version of [EDRMS]…” -- Interviewee4
- “…they were nervous at first…” --Interviewee2
- “...they were concerned that it would be hard, interfere with their everyday work…” --Interviewee2
- “[T]hey were worried about more work load.” –Interviewee2
- like everybody’s been really receptive …” --Interviewee1
- “And there was a lot of pushback from some areas that didn’t really want to use it, they worked around it, …” –IntervieweeL1
- “No, I wasn’t stressed at all actually because I could tell that there would be lots of support provided.” –IntervieweeL4
- “[B]ut not everybody was comfortable with it…” –IntervieweeL6
“[P]art of it was change, the main part, they were used to doing things their way. And, so they didn’t like anybody to change what they knew they had to do, ... they didn’t necessarily like the technology. ...”
-- Interviewee L1

“[I]t’s the unknown that scares people”
– Interviewee 3
Adjustment

- People
  - Pressure
  - Emotion
  - Personality
  - Technically savvy or not
  - Afraid of crashing the system
  - Attitude towards change
  - Mindset
  - Cheat-sheet

- Records and Information Management Culture
- IT Culture
- Training
- Organizational Culture
People: Pressure

“It’s not just like opening up a Word document and typing – blah, blah, blah – and closing it. I mean that would be ideal, if they could somehow shorten that down a bit, because you are waiting and sometimes you’re in committee, you’re in council, and everyone’s looking at you – like, she’s almost got it ready. Like, the amendment. And you’re waiting for it save. Of course the mayor – at the last meeting, he said, ‘Can you do this?’ And I just whipped it off and the mayor said ‘I see fingers flying.’ And I’m just like – it’s just a little too much pressure right now with the TV cameras rolling. Can we just not do this? I’m thinking. But then boom, and we save it, and we save and display, which is a shortcut, and then put it up on the screen. And you’re hoping you didn’t type anything wrong.”

-- IntervieweeL3
People: Emotion

• “You’ve got the anxiety of ‘how will it work, isn’t it going to do what I want it to do?’”
  –Interviewee2

• “[I]t is very frustrating”
  --Interviewee3

• “[S]ome people that are not comfortable in creating those records just because they’re not sure how to use the EDRMS.”
  -- Interviewee5
People: Personality

• “[S]he was, she was skeptical, just because you know of the insecurities of you know, of, well the lack of confidence for herself…”
  –Interviewee3

• “I also think the intimidation factor is personal, whether someone’s competitive or not, whether a person is shy, …”
  –IntervieweeL5
People: Technically Savvy or Not

• “So and then there’s other people who are technically savvy and they’ll get it, they will understand it, they’re with you blah, blah, …”

  –Interviewee3

• “[T]o me the system is intuitive, but it’s all I’ve ever known. Other people I know work off of very detailed – ‘click this button, toggle this switch, now do this, now do that’ sort of things, I think it’s more of a comfort with the technology, than it is necessarily with the system itself.”

  –IntervieweeLo
People: Afraid of Crashing the System

• “As soon as I learn, oh, you can’t press one button and it will explode! You can’t really crash the system.”
  –IntervieweeL2

• “I thought ‘well, if I make a mistake, someone is going to come and yell at me and I just deal with it and I [am] just going to be still and quiet’. But no, if it happen it’s, I am fortunate to be around very civilized people and there is no abuse among us.”
  –IntervieweeL7
People: Attitudes Towards Change

“[I]t was more just people just resistant to change, like they were using the paper thing and then the system came and it’s like a lot of learning, and they were afraid of that change and that’s why.”

–IntervieweeL9
People: Mindset

- “[T]hey’re from a generation from before computers, so they much prefer the more manual processes. And they much prefer that the fact that they had secretaries to do all of the filing work for them.”
  – Interviewee 6

- “[P]art of it has to do with the mindset of people, they think wherever I have a management type, they have an attitude that it should be filed and managed by somebody lower on the food chain than them.”
  – Interviewee 6

- “So, I think when you get new people in receptive to trying new things rather than twenty years and set in their ways, and don’t want to change.”
  – Interviewee 1
“I had to cheat when I was new. I couldn’t keep one motion type from the next straight in my head, so I had to put it in a Word document. ... I had to do that at first because it was impossible, it was so much to learn, ... And so I don’t need it anymore of course, not for a while.”

–IntervieweeL3
Records Management Culture

• “There’s definitely no naming conventions for those kinds of one-off type of filing.”
  —Interviewee5

• “And so if somebody out in the branch, ... had a taxi receipt or whatever it may be it, it was just basically just transitory, they were not allowed to make a file for that because it wasn’t their job to file that. But here that’s not the case,... and takes the time to file a lot of stuff that probably ... doesn’t need to be filed.”
  —interviewee5
“[T]hey’re used to being able to open and create a folder at any time on the Microsoft system,..., on your operating system. They’re used to right-click new folder and create a folder and away they go. So they’re not used to having an extra step.”

-- Interviewee6

“A]pparently some people were experiencing a particular issue after the upgrades, and they went around and they told everyone that – clear your cache, it will be okay. It was that type of problem. ... [T]hey took the time to let everybody know, so that was nice.”

-- IntervieweeL4
Organizational Culture

“The biggest change between where I worked before in public health and where I work now is the openness of the information. Before, the information ... was confidential ... and with good reason. Now, everything is public. And I remember when I first came, it was a bit of shock to me ... And when I first started, I actually kept putting things into the red bin out of habit, but you're not supposed to do that.”

--IntervieweeL4
Training

• “... the training session was really good, but unfortunately we did the training session before [the EDRMS] was actually set- like before we had all of our files uploaded. I didn’t realize it but it took like 4 months to upload all the files ...”

  --Interviewee4

• “[T]hey get everything set up and they get it configured ... they’ll put them through training... And they go away and they don’t use it so they forget...”

  --Interviewee5

• “... you are sitting in a classroom working with you know, fake files, and stuff you know information that’s not pertinent to your own group...”

  --Interviewee5
“So we were given training, and the focus was on the meeting portion, not so much on the bylaw part, which is I think a very specialized part of that system. ... I did receive more detailed training from my supervisor, who was the person that I worked with directly.”

–IntervieweeL4
Resist...Have it Shelved... or be “Innovative”

- “[T]hey put their guard up. ... that’ll give them a good reason, in their mind, of ‘nope it doesn’t work, nope can’t find it’...”

  --Interviewee3

- “I don’t really know what I’d like classify that quite yet, so I’m going to throw it over here make a folder in my outlook and drop it in there and I’ll go back when I have...”

  --Interviewee5

- “... I had a couple of people in the last little while that got quite creative that they would be taking the box number and putting in the alternative contained within field so that it was actually relating the box to the record, but it wasn’t actually enclosing the record in the box.”

  --Interviewee5
Strategy

- Staged Approach
- Enforcement
- Training
- On-going Support
- Instructional manual, guides
- Executive Support
- Community Learning
- System Improvement
Strategy: Staged Approach

• “I think probably the first thing I would tell her is to do it in stages, because if you don’t do it in stages you risk alienating people that would eventually come around to liking the system…”
  --Interviewee6

• “But we’re just implementing the project portion of our record keeping, because we’re just taking, a staged approach to our electronic filing.”
  --Interviewee1
**Strategy: Enforcement**

- “... that kind of **forced** them to actually have to use the system, ... So, it’s just changing, this is practice, to get them on board.”

  – IntervieweeL1

- “But otherwise, I mean, it was quite a tough time for them. I know that there was a lot of **pushback** from staff and ... they did **preserve**. ”

  – IntervieweeL1

- “...honestly if its anything in [EDRMS] is **optional**, you’re not going to see it get done because people are just barely getting there to get the file created and getting into it.”

  – Interviewee5
Strategy: Training

- “[M]ake as much training as possible available and really push the trainers to really address the needs of the staff that take the training,...” “I would probably encourage them to make more customized training, for each organization that they go and train for”
  -- Interviewee6

- “You have to personalize it, and you have to get to know the people.”
  -- Interviewee3
Strategy: On-going Support

• “[I]n a perfect world I really like to see us have more desk side support for people when they get out there.”
  -- Interviewee5

• “[T]o me I have found that it is a vital key thing to be there with somebody and walk them through the training that they’ve [done] in the classroom”
  -- Interviewee3

• “No, I wasn’t stressed at all actually because I could tell that there would be lots of support provided.”
  -- Interviewee4
“Well, we have the wiki. ... So when we have anything new come on, like this [a legislation on information accessibility] that we were given to put in the wiki, and then as soon as we finished our training about it, they gave us the link to exactly where it is in there.”

—IntervieweeL2
"[I]f you don’t have the executive buy-in, it’s not going to go anywhere ... that’s one of the main supports of your records management foundation, ... to have it coming from the top down. [I]f your executive feel it’s valuable then, it’s ... more likely to go."

–Interviewee5
Strategy: Community Learning

“If you’re thinking on your own, you don’t always think, I should tell the development team this. But sometimes when you’re talking, that shared information, you realize you’re not the only one. It’s something that you should ask about. You might think, ‘I am not sure what I’m doing, or I’m the only one who thinks that,’ but when you’re talking, it helps to realize, ‘I’m not the only one struggling’. And then one of us will say, okay, let’s fire off an email and see if we can get this fixed.”

– IntervieweeL2
Strategy: System Development

“This week, Tuesday ... we just had a bunch of new updates and there’s like new tools that we can use, like little tricks and short cuts and stuff that have been on the inside on our end, ... [T]hat have been fantastic, allowing us just to move, like little snippets of information around easily. What we used to have to copy/paste now is just import and [swoosh] from one area of the system to another.”

–intervieweeL6
Gamification

- Opinions vary from person to person
- The primary concern is that information system is for work; thus, the inclusion of these non-functional gamification elements might hinder the normal work.
  - “I just can’t see how that would be applicable, ... Because when you have things to do on it, it’s usually time sensitive, ... there is no time to joke around with it, you know?” – IntervieweeL8
  - “I mean do people want to play game when they’re looking for a piece of information?” – IntervieweeL6
Gamification

• Another frequent response is that interviewees often cannot see how this is going to happen
  – E.g., “I don’t think so, because records, record-keeping is pretty straightforward and cut-and-dried and ... and I don’t see how you would do it?” ---Interviewee1

The inclusion of ‘fun’ element is good. But it has to be functional and relevant to their work. Otherwise, it will generate unnecessary distraction.
“So, if there’s a fun element, it will make it more interesting and maybe more understandable as well to the public, if that’s possible.”

–Interviewee L4

“So rather than levels or certificates ... it has its own internal ability to sort of present us with our own achievements ... So you may not be rewarded for it with a bunny or a shining star, or something, but there’s something to be said about just like something that can actually tell you how hard you’ve worked.”

--- Interviewee L6
Bring Your Own Devices (BYOD)

- Is it necessary?
  - Work from home, on the go, or mobile work

- Is it possible?
  - Secure network to connect to the system
    - E.g., “I always thought that the issues with that arrangement has to do with security, just to make sure that it’s a secure ...”
      --IntervieweeL4
    - Increasingly they are dealing with electronic records
    - Confidentiality
    - Privacy
    - Who will pay for the devices and the usage
Bring Your Own Devices (BYOD)

- **Is it suitable?**
  - "It because it’s so document heavy... there’s so much to read, so it’s like, I mean on the small device? ... but, if you change the whole look of it or, like um, I don’t know, maybe have...”
  
  – IntervieweeL9
The Cloud

- **Security**
  - E.g., “I would imagine that there are maybe some security issues with that.” — IntervieweeL4

- **Confidentiality**
  - E.g., “The confidentiality you know, that you don’t want people to see, but the actual concept, yeah.” — IntervieweeL2

- **Privacy**
  - E.g., “… but on the whole cloud services are really restricted because of privacy legislation.” — IntervieweeL6

- **The level of sensitivity of the information**
  - E.g., “[C]loud or no cloud, cloud’s fine. We are not hiding anything. The security of the information is actually quite low. We don’t want it transformed, so as long as its integrity stays intact, …” — IntervieweeL6
Trust or Not?

• Most of the respondents say that they trust the system. But different reasons have been given in terms of why.

• For those that don’t trust the system, the explanation is that they don’t understand the technology.
  – E.g., “I think that its mistrust and insecurity of a system because they’re not technically savvy.” –Interviewee3

• For those that trust the system, one explanation is that they have done triple-check on the information put into the system to make sure that there are no errors.

• However, as one respondent points out that, what is more interesting is if people from the outside trust the information they put there.
Influence on Records Management

• “[P]eople are realizing it’s not just the records clerk who manages records ... it’s reinforcing the fact that everybody is responsible for managing records.”
  – Interviewee1

• “... I think we rely on EDRMS now that we have it. So rather than try to come up with some sort of new writing, I’ll often use [EDRMS] as search tool ... I will search for an old legal opinion rather than trying to write a new legal opinion on my own.”
  – Interviewee4
Conclusion

Factors
- People
- Records management culture
- IT culture
- Organizational culture
- Training

Strategy
- Staged approach
- Enforcement
- Training
- On-going support
- Instructional manual, guides
- Executive support
- Community learning
- System improvement
Resources

• InterPARES Trust
  https://interparestrust.org/

• The Fun Theory
  http://www.thefuntheory.com/

Special Thanks to Paige Hohmann, Jennifer Vanderfluit, and Rachel De Brouwer Students from UBC and University of Toronto
Contact Information

Weimei Pan
weimei.pan@ubc.ca

Lisa Daulby
lisa.daulby@sjsu.edu